

PENN NEIGHBORHOOD SURVEY PROJECT

MARY JO WINDER
PRESERVATION COORDINATOR
CITY OF ST. JOSEPH, MISSOURI

JULY 29, 1988

This Project funded by the State of Missouri Department of Natural Resources, Division of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation by a grant under provisions of the Historic Preservation Act of 1966, as amended, from the National Park Service, U.S. Department of the Interior and the Department of Community Development, City of St. Joseph, Missouri.

PENN NEIGHBORHOOD SURVEY - RESEARCH DESIGN

Objective

The purpose of the Penn Neighborhood Historic Resource Survey is to identify and document architectural artifacts so that patterns of development and property type(s) can be discerned. The documentation of physically present resources helps establish a relationship to the past and thus provides an understanding of and appreciation for the history of the City of St. Joseph.

Boundary Description

Boundaries of the area to be surveyed are Messanie Street on the north; South Fourteenth Street on the east; Mitchell Avenue on the south; and an arbitrary boundary to include residential properties on South Ninth and South Tenth Streets on the west.

Historic Context

On site and archival research will provide material evidence of specific properties so that the city's intact architectural resources can be related to their historic context. Since the entire Penn Neighborhood survey area was within the city's limits by 1857, buildings from the date forward are expected to be in evidence.

a. Early Settlement to 1865 - John Patee came to St. Joseph in 1845 just two years after Joseph Robidoux platted the original town. He purchased 320 acres south of Robidoux and Smith Additions, platted what was known as Pateetown and began selling building lots in 1849. St. Joseph was already an established distribution-of-goods center and a departure point for the westward movement. The gold rush of 1849 contributed to the development of St. Joseph during this period. By 1860 the City's population had reached 9,000. The St. Joseph City Directory of 1859-60 contains the April 11, 1859 Inaugural address of Mayor M. Jeff Thompson, which states Patee's First Addition as being "well built upon" with residential buildings, and that "Mr. John Patee has also nearly completed his large new hotel . . . 140 X 148 feet, four stories . . . located in Patee's Addition." Mayor Thompson also called for building market houses in "upper" and "lower" wards of the City as an inducement for selling cheaper lots in the southern portion of the City, so that rather than overcrowding into rental housing in the upper-class neighborhoods in the east and northern parts of the city, citizens could buy and build on their own land and be within reach of a market. He requested \$3,000 of city monies for the two markets and Patee Market House was opened the following year on South 10th Street between Olive and Lafayette Streets.

Activity in the area around the Patee House and Market were increased by the coming of the Hannibal and St. Joseph Railroad in February, 1859 and the construction of a depot on South 8th Street, four blocks west of the Patee House Hotel. Also, in 1860, the excitement of the short-lived Pony Express centered around the neighborhood. The company's headquarters of the Russell, Majors and Waddell Central Overland Express, was housed in the Patee House Hotel and its stables were located two blocks west. The Hannibal and St. Joseph Railway Company also maintained an office in the hotel.

By 1865, the area experienced economic depression partially associated with the Civil War. Patee House served as headquarters for the Union Army during the war. After the war, the property was "raffled off" by John Patee (the winning number drawn was an unsold ticket and the property reverted back to Patee).

The period of 1845 to 1865 was historically the most important developmental period in the 160-acre tract between Messanie and Mitchell, Ninth and Fourteenth Streets. Today Patee House still stands, a reminder of this significant era. After several years of use as a factory, it was restored in 1963 and is now the Patee House Museum. Patee Market stands where it was built in 1860; it now serves as facilities for the city's health department and municipal court. The Pony Express Stables, rebuilt in the 1880's from a frame to a brick structure, remains on its site, and has become the Pony Express Museum. The block John Patee gave to the city for a park in 1849 remains on the block between Ninth and Tenth, Penn and Seneca Streets. Also, twenty acres of land given to the St. Joseph Hannibal Railroad remains undivided, the site of commercial/manufacturing facilities.

The current survey project will attempt to identify residential buildings constructed during the 1845-65 period. Surviving characteristics of Greek Revival, Italianate and Gothic Revival will relate dwellings to this period, even though many have likely received extensive exterior alterations.

b. 1865 to 1890 - After the Civil War, St. Joseph continued growing in population. In 1870, 19,565 citizens inhabited the City; by 1880 there were over 32,000; in 1890, over 52,000. A thriving wholesale industry that began as a trading post when Joseph Robidoux came to the area, became the city's most important economic factor. Banks and other businesses that supported the growing industry flourished during the period. Residential development continued in the city's additions that had been platted by 1860. St. Joseph's rapidly increasing population resulted in new construction and the updating and expansion of existing dwellings. Since the citizens depended primarily on public transportation in their daily lives, locating close to streetcar lines and commercial areas that provided necessary services was important. Therefore, working-class through upper-class dwellings were built within close proximity, if not intermingled, in the city's neighborhoods. In Patee's Addition, as in others, the more modest houses tended to remain clustered in low-lying areas (in relation to the hills surrounding the city's core) and around the commercial/industrial area.

Upon completion of a railroad bridge across the Missouri River in 1873 St. Joseph's importance as a wholesale/distribution center was assured. The city's industrial development began spreading along the river and railroad lines; its southward expansion from the original town center influenced development in Patee's Addition. During this period, Patee Hotel was a female seminary (1865-1885).

Architectural resources from the 1865-90 period currently in evidence will exhibit elements of Italianate, Gothic, Queen Anne (and other Victorian styles) and Classic Revival architecture. Characteristics of these styles will have been added onto buildings constructed in the previous period, thus traits of both on a single building will likely be apparent.

c. 1890 to 1915 - Distribution of goods by rail continued to be significant during this period. Great Plains agriculture products, especially livestock, became the major commodities that provided vitality to St. Joseph's economy. The construction of the St. Joseph Livestock Exchange building on a site overlooking 450 acres of stock yards, and the opening of three major meat packing industries corresponded with the construction of other industrial, commercial, civic, public and residential buildings. The City's population reached almost 80,000 by 1900.

Classicism continued to be a major influence in architectural design on a grand scale in commercial, industrial and public architecture. Design characteristics of architects of the period also appeared in St. Joseph, among them, H.H. Richardson, Frank Lloyd Wright and Louis Sullivan. In residential architecture, Queen Anne trends continued, but the major influences were Colonial Revival, the bungalow, Richardsonian Romanesque, and the Arts and Crafts movement.

In St. Joseph, as in other cities across the United States, development continued to center around the railroads, public transportation and the major commercial areas. Residential building activity repeated the pattern of the previous period. The increasing popularity of the automobile in the early part of the twentieth century brought street improvements to the city's residential neighborhoods. Industrial/commercial activity slowly spread and began encroaching upon the neighborhoods adjacent to the earlier land use areas of this type.

Patee Addition continued to experience building activity. Patee House Hotel was sold in 1886 to R.L. McDonald & Company for the production of shirts. Commercial development remained concentrated along the western and southern fringes. Residential construction in the neighborhood was substantial throughout the 1890-1915 period. Surviving dwellings, will exhibit characteristics that will relate them to their period's historic context.

d. 1915 to 1940 - The livestock and packing industries continued to bolster the city's economy from 1900-1930, when St. Joseph was recognized as one of the five largest livestock markets in the world. After 1900, however, other economic influences began to inhibit growth and erode the prosperity of the city. Population figures dropped between 1900 and 1910 and then remained virtually stable for the next several decades. World War I caused the demand and price for goods produced in St. Joseph to decline. Because much of St. Joseph's industry was based on farm goods, the agriculture depression of the period naturally spread to the city. These factors, along with a trend to change the nation's distribution-of-goods system, caused a negative

Impact felt for years to come. The subsequent decline of value in real estate and visual appearance of buildings was a predictable occurrence in the established neighborhoods and commercial areas.

St. Joseph's inner-city neighborhoods experienced little development and change after 1920, other than minor updating and an increase in multi-family units. Architectural influences during the 1915-1940 period were the Bungalow, Colonial (and other classic) Revival(s), and Prairie styles.

Since the area of the current survey was nearly all developed by the second decade of the twentieth century, examples that exhibit these period characteristics are expected to be rare. Changes since 1920 to the present likely to be found in the survey are those that have resulted from deterioration, rehabilitation and/or demolition of properties within the neighborhood.

Research Background

The Penn Neighborhood Historic Resource Survey project is part of the continuing effort to identify and establish property types as a chronicle of the social, economic and physical development of the city from mid-nineteenth century to the present. Related surveys that may yield background information and establish continuity to the city's historical development will be considered. These include projects documenting the Clay Street Historic District, the Central Business District, Museum Hill Historic District, Robidoux Hill Historic District, Hall Street Historic District, Buchanan Triangle and Cathedral Hill I and II Districts.

Research Procedure

Approximately 200 buildings within the proposed survey boundaries will be assessed for their significance as contributing elements to the city's historic context, both individually or as groupings of property type. On-site information gathering will include photographing individual building/structures and recording visual data for each (i.e., number of bays, stylistic characteristics, etc.). An estimate of the construction date by evaluating historic architectural characteristics will serve as a guideline for further archival research. Public documents to be consulted will include the Buchanan County Record of Deeds, and the City of St. Joseph building permit files and plat map records. Other sources expected to yield information for documentation are historic Sanborn maps, city directories dating from 1860, and period accounts such as newspapers, periodicals, and other historic publications.

All survey research and required documentation procedures will be performed by the architectural preservation coordinator consultant contracted by the City of St. Joseph.

Hypothesis

Expected results of the Penn Neighborhood Survey project will yield property types that reflect the city's patterns of cultural and economic development. Otherwise stated, if significant historic resources are documented within the survey area, then physical evidence of the city's cultural heritage can be identified, and thus, preserved.

PENN NEIGHBORHOOD SURVEY PROJECT - FINAL REPORT
by MARY JO WINDER
JULY 29, 1988

Introduction to Project

The Penn Neighborhood Survey began in March and was completed in July, 1988. It was realized early in the project the urgency of documenting historic resources within the survey boundaries. The alarming rate at which many of the buildings were (and still are) being demolished (by neglect and ultimately by dismantling) was grave testimony that this area of the City required attention. It was obvious that much of the area had been in a state of continuous decline for decades. Demolition of many of the buildings has left innumerable gaps that have, in at least parts of the neighborhood, interfered with the ambience that historically was present in it. The decline is most obvious on Ninth and Tenth Streets south to Olive Street (Olive to Mitchell on these two streets is primarily commercial). Other than a few isolated exceptions, the entire Messanie to Mitchell length along Eleventh Street, Vine Street and Twelfth Street exhibited signs of a cycle of decline that ultimately tends toward the loss of valuable housing stock. Though similar signs of deterioration were in occurrence along Fourteenth Street, the rate has been slower. This may be partly due to the fact that more buildings that were built later (mostly around the turn of the century) than those west of Thirteenth Street. There were fewer vacant lots on Fourteenth Street and it appeared that a more concentrated effort of rehabilitation was being made on both sides of this street (the east side of street was not included in the current survey). An exception in the entire survey area was an approximate one and one-half block of dwellings on Thirteenth Street south of Messanie South. Most of the originally upper-class residential buildings on this street appeared to have been maintained as single family residences. They were consistently sited on larger lots than dwellings in other parts of the survey area, which most likely has contributed to their being isolated from the deterioration around them. The oldest building on Thirteenth Street is a circa 1860 Italianate dwelling at number 619 (Inventory #150) that has been beautifully maintained. There is one other notable dwelling of this period at 628 South Thirteenth Street (#140). Most of the buildings were constructed just after the turn of the century, however, the most apparent wear-and-tear along this portion of Thirteenth Street was near the north end as one approaches Messanie Street.

Over all, the area of the survey probably never was considered one of the more prominent or economically viable parts of St. Joseph. Though there was still evidence of upper-middle to upper income level dwellings, many much more modest single family or multi-unit dwellings were interspersed throughout the area. Mayor Jeff Thompson inaugural speech where he specified that a market be placed in the south ward of the City for the convenience of the working class so it would be close to areas where land was affordable to them gives evidence to the fact that already (in 1858) there was a trend for the area to be of a lower social/economic class than in the areas north of Messanie. By the early 1880's, industrial and commercial areas were already well-established along the south and west periphery of the area. This presence, and the fact that the areas north and northeast of "Pateetown" were preferred areas by the more affluent citizens had an effect on this area.

Project Sources of Information

Before commencement of the Penn Neighborhood Survey, an announcement explaining the project was placed in the monthly newsletter of this neighborhood's organization. Also, the (March), monthly organizational meeting was attended for the purpose of giving information, answering questions and receiving input from neighborhood residents.

Primary sources of information that provided specific information were the City of St. Joseph building permit record files that date from 1887 and Sanborn Insurance maps of 1883, 1888, 1897 and 1911, which are on microfilm in the Buchanan County Courthouse, Recorder of Deeds Office. Though many of the buildings had already been constructed well before, the 1883 Sanborn map provided documentation of all that was in the area from Messanie Street to Mitchell Avenue, and from Nineth Street to east of properties on the east side of Vine Street and Twelfth Street. The 1888 map documented a larger area that included all of the properties within the survey boundaries. A few properties that were obviously constructed after 1887 and did not have building permit records were documented by their presence on the Sanborn maps of 1897 or 1911 (corrected in 1939).

Additional Historical Information

Substantial evidence of residential and commercial development in Patee's First Addition by the late 1850's is in the '858 inaugural speech of Mayor Jeff Thompson and in the documentation of construction of the 110 room Patee

House hotel in 1858. Mayor Thompson expounded on the addition as being "well built upon" with many brick structures and on the hotel's quality. His statement of building a market is supported by the finances being proposed for it and another in the "upper ward." Patee market is listed in the 1860 St. Joseph City Directory. It was constructed on the south end of the east one-half of Block 37; a smaller brick building than the present Patee Market. It also housed "Hose Company No. 2" (1883 Sanborn map). On the 1888 Sanborn map a separate building on the north part of the half block housed the fire station. The present building was constructed in 1906-1909 at a cost of approximately \$41,000. It also included an open area in front of the building that was centered by a circular garden area. (Patee Market was included in the previous Central Business District survey.)

In his book, Old Saint Jo, Sheridan A. Logan provides an account of John Patee. He was born in 1794 in Mulford, New York. In 1840, he moved with his family to Rockhouse Prairie in Buchanan County where he manufactured and sold a machine for separating grain. He came to St. Joseph in 1845 and purchased two quarter sections of land at a cost of \$13.00 per acre.

He opened a drugstore in 1845 and was one of the organizers of the St. Joseph Branch of the Bank of Missouri in 1857. Plat map records show he filed plans for Patee's Addition in 1857. In 1858, he commissioned L.S. Stigers to build his hotel. Patee's residence was on the west side of Tenth Street, between Patee and Olive streets (the 1883 Sanborn map shows frame dwellings on the block; none are presently in existence). 1861 through 1868 city directories listed him as a real estate dealer residing at the corner of Tenth Street and Locust (the 1883 Sanborn map shows a large, diagonally sited dwelling at this location). John Patee died February 13, 1868 and was buried in Mt. Mora Cemetery.

The 1883 Sanborn map also indicated the livery stable that is now the Pony Express Museum at 916-18 Penn Street. Mr. Logan relates that the original frame building was constructed in 1858 by Ben Holladay who sold it to the Central Overland California and Pike's Peak Express Company in 1860. It was used for the Pony Express until that venture ended October 26, 1861. The building was rebuilt of brick in 1887 by the St. Joseph Transfer Company. Some original structural elements were retained. (Listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1970.)

Bela M. Hughes, for whom the addition that includes the block between Thirteenth and Fourteenth Streets in the vicinity of Locust to Patee Streets was named, is mentioned in Sheridan Logan's book. In 1861, Ben Holladay sent his cousin, Mr. Hughes, to Denver to head the office of the financially troubled Central Overland California and Pike's Peak Express. Before that time, he was listed in the 1859-60 City Directory as a lawyer residing on Thirteenth Street "near the Convent", (the convent refers to the now demolished facility on the north side of Messanie at Twelfth Street). The existing Italianate dwelling at 619 South Thirteenth Street was likely his residence.

Mr. Logan also wrote an account of the story of the killing of Jesse James who moved to St. Joseph in 1881 with his wife and children. In the book, his executioner, Bob Ford, related going to the James's home at 1318 Lafayette "in the suburbs of St. Joseph." The building is no longer at that address; the small, frame house has been moved and is sited on the grounds of the Patee Museum where it is exhibited for its association with its famous resident.

The first documentation of the neighborhood east of Vine Street is the 1883 Sanborn map of the city. Though there are no maps other than the city map it clearly indicates the streets and vacant areas from Vine to Thirteenth Street, Messanie to Olive; and from Thirteenth to Fourteenth Streets, Seneca to Mitchell Avenue.

Explanation of Inventory Form Data

"Location of Negatives" - Negatives of photographs are filed with the Department of Planning and Zoning, City Hall, 11th and Frederick, St. Joseph, Missouri. Roll #1-1 means roll #1 of 16 total, frame #1.

"Legal Description" - Metes and bounds legal descriptions are not provided. In instances where more than one building occupies a lot or parts of more than one lot, the legal description states simply, i.e., "Part of Lots 1 and 2, Block 3, Highly Addition".

"Date(s) or Period" - Dates without the prefix "c" or "ca" (circa) are documented construction dates gleaned from the City of St. Joseph building permit files, records of which begin in the year 1887. A few of the buildings inventoried have verifiable earlier construction dates, the earliest being an 1870 dwelling whose occupant is documented in both the

Buchanan County Record of Deeds and the 1870 city directory. The earliest Sanborn Insurance map of the area (1888) documented some properties in the survey that are east of Mt. Mora Cemetery. All significant properties that do not have building permit records are verifiable on the Sanborn map of 1911 (corrected in 1939).

"Style or Design" - Attributing a "style" to an individual building, in some cases, is a rather subjective matter, however, an attempt was made to determine major character defining features to place a particular building within a stylistic category. Where more than one period style is apparent, the most significant and/or obvious is presented first with "sub-styles" following. In the absence of prominent design features, the building is placed in the "vernacular" category. This term is defined here according to this researchers use of the term as, "common" architecture; a building that exhibits certain period structural and functional elements, but lacks the ornamentation and/or design characteristics of established period styles. Although a vernacular building may have some ornamentation, if the basic structure is of a common variety, the designation is vernacular as a primary style; other influences are listed secondarily. Likewise, the designation of a period style as primary to a structure and vernacular a sub-style means the character defining features of the architectural style are more prominent than its vernacularism.

"No. of Bays": Bays, as it refers to the vertical divisions of a building or structure, are, most often, defined by the presence of windows or doors within those bays. Bays are also present where no openings exist as in a side wing where corners of the elevation view are prominent vertical division. Also, a two-bay porch means that the structure has three vertical supports; the spaces in-between are the bays.

"Condition" - Designations of "poor", "fair", "good" and "excellent" are used. Condition is based on, first, the physical existence of historic architectural elements and, second, on the apparent condition of the historic building materials (or finishes) themselves. "Good" and "excellent" means that most to all original features (including later alterations or additions that are considered historic) are intact

and would require minor to moderate maintenance or repair to preserve architectural integrity. "Poor" and "fair" means that many original features have been removed, and/or that remaining elements are in a state of deterioration, and/or that unsympathetic alterations are hiding or detracting from the remaining historic features.

Survey Data

Two hundred six inventory forms were completed in the Penn Neighborhood Survey Project. In a few instances, where more than one building was similar and all were obviously constructed at the same time, two or more dwellings were recorded on a single inventory sheet. A total of two hundred ten buildings were documented in the survey, nine of them were non-residential buildings. Residential buildings that exhibited architectural integrity and were considered to be contributing historic resources numbered one hundred ninety four; seven non-contributing residential buildings were recorded on inventory forms. (Note: The non-contributing number does not include all of this category in the survey area; those that were recorded had minimal integrity, therefore, in their present state, were considered not to have historical/architectural significance.)

All non-residential buildings documented possessed significance. They included three circa 1870 churches, a school (1909), a fire station (circa 1939), and three commercial structures (a circa 1880/1923, one-story neighborhood store, a small 1923 Classic Revival office building, and an 1899, two-story warehouse building). The Patee House Museum, which is already listed on the National Register of Historic Places, was also inventoried.

Analysis of Survey Data

Of the one hundred ninety-four contributing residential buildings in the project area, one hundred thirty-nine were single family dwellings, forty-six were duplexes and nine were multi-family residences. Thirty-six of the total (201) recorded residential structures were believed to be constructed before 1865, fifty-seven between 1865 and 1890, ninety-five between 1891 and 1915, and thirteen between 1916 and 1940.

Property type classification varied from definite vernacular, dwellings of the lower economic class to large mansions of the upper class; the latter being few in

number. The majority of duplexes probably originally housed middle class residences.

Stylistic features of designated residential buildings were attributed as follows:

- Greek Revival, constructed ca 1845-1860: four single family.
- Italianate/Gothic Revival, constructed ca 1860-1880: twenty-six single family, twelve duplexes, one multi-family.
- Second Empire, constructed ca 1870: five single family, one duplex.
- Queen Anne, constructed ca 1880-1905: twenty-four single family, ten duplexes.
- Colonial Revival, constructed ca 1890-1915: sixteen single family, four duplexes.
- Classic Revival, constructed ca 1900-1915: twelve single family, fifteen duplexes, four multi-family.
- Romanesque, constructed ca 1890: one single family, one multi-family.
- Renaissance Revival, constructed ca 1890: one duplex.
- Neoclassical, constructed ca 1900-1915: ten single family, one duplex, three multi-family.
- Bungalow/Arts & Crafts, constructed ca 1905-1930: nine single family, two duplexes.
- Eclectic, constructed ca 1900: one single family.
- Vernacular, constructed ca 1850-1920: thirty-six single family, one duplex, one multi-family.

Residential property types that were documented in the project area give evidence of those that were established in the recent report, "Property Type Analysis" by Deon Wolfenbarger. The dwellings' association with certain historic contexts, as they were defined in this project's "Research Design" and in the more comprehensive "Historic Context Statement", by Deon Wolfenbarger, can be assumed with the concrete evidence provided on the inventory forms. (This researcher must "assume"

association because actual records of some of the buildings were not available or in existence. For purposes of this report, assumption must suffice since all of the properties could not be documented.)

Recommendations

- A. National Register Nominations - There were at least three buildings in the Penn Neighborhood survey area that would be individually eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places. The ca 1860 Italianate dwelling at 619 South Thirteenth Street is an outstanding example of its architectural type. It also has possible significance as a representation of a dwelling that reflects the economic, cultural and social values of the city's early commerce period and/or as it is associated with an important figure in the history of the city (Bela M. Hughes). 628 South Thirteenth is another notable representation of Italianate residential property type. 701 South Eleventh Street is a good example of Richardsonian Romanesque influence. It may also have significance as a design executed by Harvey Ellis and it is important in its association with the original owner who was a prominent businessman in the city's wholesale industry. Other possibly eligible buildings are at 609 South Thirteenth Street and 1322 Olive Street; both are outstanding examples of Neoclassical single family dwellings. 1101 South Eleventh Street is a significant ca 1850 vernacular, Greek Revival cottage.

Areas of the current survey could be included in the already established Museum Hill Historic District. Dwellings in the north part in the block of Ninth Street south of Messanie, on Tenth Street from Messanie to Patee, on the south side of Messanie and on the north part of Thirteenth Street from Messanie to approximately on a line even with Mary Street have a strong style and character relationship to those in the Museum Hill district. Another district on the east side of the survey area is possible; however, the eastern edge of the potential district needs to be defined which would require further survey work. The west boundary would likely be a line running south from Messanie west of the properties on Fourteenth Street to Olive Street, west to Thirteenth Street, south to Lafayette Street, west to Vine Street, south to Seneca Street, east to Twelfth Street, south to Penn Street, east to east side of Patee Museum, south to Mitchell Avenue and east to Fourteenth Street. Vine Street itself

remains a completely intact, brick street and should be included as a contributing element.

A building that was not photographed that contributes to the proposed district was included in the survey data after boundaries were drawn. It is a Colonial Revival duplex constructed in 1909 at 1013-15 Vine Street (Inventory #117A).

Comprehensive Preservation Planning

Future community development activity in the proposed districts within the Penn Neighborhood survey area should focus on appropriate rehabilitation and revitalization. There are many viable buildings that would enhance the historic characteristics that are present if proper preservation tools and techniques were applied. The problems of abandonment and neglect should be addressed particularly in the proposed districts.

Dwellings outside of the two boundaries that also should be considered worthy of rehabilitation or preservation are properties documented on form numbers: 13, 14, 38, 39, 40, 41, 56, 57, 59, 60, 65, 69, 75, 76, 77, 80, 82, 103, 104, 105, 109, 110, and 202. Also, an undocumented ca 1870 dwelling in the survey area at 919 South Eleventh Street has high integrity as a representation of Italianate residential property type.

Conclusion

An important activity for achieving either National Register/local landmark designation or a feasible, comprehensive historic preservation plan is public education. It is important that this study (and other historic resource surveys) be made known and readily available to the general public, special interest groups and political leaders, and that it be in a usable and understandable form so that information and data can be used by city planners and other city staff who administer programs involving historic buildings and areas.

Copies of this report are being furnished to public officials, city staff and the media. Original inventory forms, photographs, maps and reports are deposited with the State of Missouri Department of Natural Resources, Division of Parks, Recreation, and Historic Preservation. Reproductions of all project documents are located in the Department of Community Development, St. Joseph City Hall for the benefit of the citizens of the community. The historic preservation movement becomes a futile effort if historic building research documents are filed away only to be used by other historic preservation professionals.

PENN NEIGHBORHOOD SURVEY PROJECT - FINAL REPORT
by MARY JO WINDER
JULY 29, 1988

Introduction to Project

The Penn Neighborhood Survey began in March and was completed in July, 1988. It was realized early in the project the urgency of documenting historic resources within the survey boundaries. The alarming rate at which many of the buildings were (and still are) being demolished (by neglect and ultimately by dismantling) was grave testimony that this area of the City required attention. It was obvious that much of the area had been in a state of continuous decline for decades. Demolition of many of the buildings had left innumerable gaps that have, in at least parts of the neighborhood, interfered with the ambience that historically was present in it. The decline was most obvious on Ninth and Tenth Streets south to Olive Street (Olive to Mitchell on these two streets is primarily commercial). Other than a few isolated exceptions, the entire Messanie to Mitchell length along Eleventh Street, Vine Street and Twelfth Street exhibited signs of a cycle of decline that ultimately tends toward the loss of valuable housing stock. Though similar signs of deterioration were in occurrence along Fourteenth Street, the rate has been slower. This may be partly due to the fact that more of these buildings were built later (mostly around the turn of the century) than those west of Thirteenth Street. There were fewer vacant lots on Fourteenth Street and it appeared that a more concentrated effort of rehabilitation was being made on both sides of this street (the east side of street was not included in the current survey). An exception in the entire survey area was an approximate one and one-half block of dwellings on Thirteenth Street south of Messanie South. Most of the originally upper-class residential buildings on this street appeared to have been maintained as single family residences and they were consistently sited on larger lots than dwellings in other parts of the survey area. Both factors have, most likely, contributed to their being isolated from the deterioration around them. The most apparent wear-and-tear along this portion of Thirteenth Street was near the north end as one approaches Messanie Street.

The oldest building on Thirteenth Street is a circa 1860 Italianate dwelling at number 619 (Inventory #150). It has been beautifully maintained. There is one other notable dwelling of this period at 628 South Thirteenth Street (#140). Most of the buildings were constructed just after the turn of the century.

Over all, the area of the survey probably never was considered one of the more prominent or economically viable parts of St. Joseph. Though there was still evidence of upper-middle to upper income level dwellings, many much more modest single family or multi-unit dwellings were interspersed throughout the area. In his inaugural speech in 1858 Mayor Jeff Thompson specified that a market be placed in the south ward of the City for the convenience of the working class so it would be close to areas where land was affordable to them. This gives evidence that early in the City's history there was a trend toward a lower social/economic class neighborhood than in the areas north of Messanie. By the early 1880's, industrial and commercial areas were well-established along the south and west periphery of the area. This presence, and the preference for housing in the areas north and northeast of "Pateetown" by the more affluent citizens, had an effect on this area.

Project Sources of Information

Before commencement of the Penn Neighborhood Survey, an announcement explaining the project was placed in the monthly newsletter of this neighborhood's organization. The March organizational meeting was also attended for the purpose of giving information, answering questions and receiving input from neighborhood residents.

Primary sources of information that provided specific information were the City of St. Joseph building permit record files that date from 1887 and Sanborn insurance maps of 1883, 1888, 1897 and 1911, which are on microfilm in the Buchanan County Courthouse, Recorder of Deeds Office. Though many of the buildings had already been constructed well before, the 1883 Sanborn map provided documentation of all that was in the area from Messanie Street to Mitchell Avenue, and from Ninth Street to east of properties on the east side of Vine Street and Twelfth Street. The 1888 map documented a larger area that included all of the properties within the survey boundaries. A few properties that were obviously constructed after 1887 but did not have building permit records were documented by their presence on the Sanborn maps of 1897 or 1911.

Additional Historical Information

Evidence of residential and commercial development in Patee's First Addition by the late 1850's is contained in the 1858 inaugural speech of Mayor Jeff Thompson and in the documentation of construction of the 110 room Patee

House hotel in 1858. Mayor Thompson expounded of the addition as being "well built upon" with many brick structures and of the hotel's quality. The need for building Patee Market was supported by the statement of finances proposed for it and another in the "upper ward." Patee Market was constructed by 1860 and listed in the St. Joseph City Directory of 1859-60. It was located on the south end of the east one-half of Block 37; a smaller brick building than the present Patee Market. This original structure also housed "Hose Company No. 2" (1883 Sanborn map). The 1888 Sanborn map shows a separate building on the north part of the half block housing the fire station. The present building was constructed in 1906-1909 at a cost of approximately \$41,000. The design included an open area in front of the building centered by a circular "green space". (Patee Market building was included in the previous Central Business District survey.)

In his book, Old Saint Jo, Sheridan A. Logan provides an account of John Patee. He was born in 1794 in Mulford, New York. In 1840, he moved with his family to Rockhouse Prairie in Buchanan County where he manufactured and sold a machine for separating grain. He came to St. Joseph in 1845 and purchased two quarter sections of land at a cost of \$13.00 per acre.

He opened a drugstore in 1845 and was one of the organizers of the St. Joseph Branch of the Bank of Missouri in 1857. Plat map records show he filed plans for Patee's Addition in 1857. In 1858, he commissioned L.S. Stigers to build his hotel. Patee's residence was on the west side of Tenth Street, between Patee and Olive streets (the 1883 Sanborn map shows frame dwellings on the block; none are presently in existence). In 1861 he was listed in the city directory as a real estate dealer residing at the corner of Tenth Street and Locust (the 1883 Sanborn map shows a large, diagonally sited dwelling at this location). John Patee died February 13, 1868 and was buried in Mt. Mora Cemetery.

The 1883 Sanborn map also indicates the livery stable that is now the Pony Express Museum at 916-18 Penn Street. Mr. Logan relates that the original frame building was constructed in 1858 by Ben Holladay who sold it to the Central Overland California and Pike's Peak Express Company in 1860. It was used for the Pony Express until that venture ended October 26, 1861. The building was rebuilt of brick in 1887 by the St. Joseph Transfer Company. Some original structural elements were retained. (Listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1970.)

Bela M. Hughes, for whom the addition that includes the block between Thirteenth and Fourteenth Streets in the vicinity of Locust to Patee Streets was named, is mentioned in Sheridan Logan's book. In 1861, Ben Holladay sent his cousin, Mr. Hughes, to Denver to head the office of the financially troubled Central Overland California and Pike's Peak Express. Before that time, he was listed in the 1859-60 City Directory as a lawyer residing on Thirteenth Street "near the Convent", (the convent refers to the now demolished facility on the north side of Messanie at Twelfth Street). The existing Italianate dwelling at 619 South Thirteenth Street was likely his residence.

Mr. Logan also wrote an account of the story of the killing of Jesse James who moved to St. Joseph in 1881 with his wife and children. In the book, his executioner, Bob Ford, related going to the James's home at 1318 Lafayette "in the suburbs of St. Joseph." The building is no longer at that address; the small, frame house has been moved and is sited on the grounds of the Patee Museum where it is exhibited for its association with its famous resident.

The first documentation of the neighborhood east of Vine Street is the 1883 Sanborn map of the city. Though there are no maps other than the city map, it clearly indicates the streets and vacant areas from Vine to Thirteenth Street, Messanie to Olive; and from Thirteenth to Fourteenth Streets, Seneca to Mitchell Avenue.

Explanation of Inventory Form Data

- "Location of Negatives" - Negatives of photographs are filed with the Department of Planning and Zoning, City Hall, 11th and Frederick, St. Joseph, Missouri. Roll #1-1 means roll #1 of 16 total, frame #1.
- "Legal Description" - Metes and bounds legal descriptions are not provided. In instances where more than one building occupies a lot or parts of more than one lot, the legal description states simply, i.e., "Part of Lots 1 and 2, Block 3, Highly Addition".
- "Date(s) or Period" - Dates without the prefix "c" or "ca" (circa) are documented construction dates gleaned from the City of St. Joseph building permit files, records of which begin in the year 1887. A few of the buildings inventoried have verifiable earlier construction dates, the earliest being an 1870 dwelling whose occupant is documented in both the

Buchanan County Record of Deeds and the 1870 city directory. The earliest Sanborn Insurance map of the area (1888) documented some properties in the survey that are east of Mt. Mora Cemetery. All significant properties that do not have building permit records are verifiable on the Sanborn map of 1911 (corrected in 1939).

"Style or Design" - Attributing a "style" to an individual building, in some cases, is a rather subjective matter, however, an attempt was made to determine major character defining features to place a particular building within a stylistic category. Where more than one period style is apparent, the most significant and/or obvious is presented first with "sub-styles" following. In the absence of prominent design features, the building is placed in the "vernacular" category. This term is defined here according to this researchers use of the term as, "common" architecture; a building that exhibits certain period structural and functional elements, but lacks the ornamentation and/or design characteristics of established period styles. Although a vernacular building may have some ornamentation, if the basic structure is of a common variety, the designation is vernacular as a primary style; other influences are listed secondarily. Likewise, the designation of a period style as primary to a structure and vernacular a sub-style means the character defining features of the architectural style are more prominent than its vernacularism.

"No. of Bays": Bays, as it refers to the vertical divisions of a building or structure, are, most often, defined by the presence of windows or doors within those bays. Bays are also present where no openings exist as in a side wing where corners of the elevation view are prominent vertical division. Also, a two-bay porch means that the structure has three vertical supports; the spaces in-between are the bays.

"Condition" - Designations of "poor", "fair", "good" and "excellent" are used. Condition is based on, first, the physical existence of historic architectural elements and, second, on the apparent condition of the historic building materials (or finishes) themselves. "Good" and "excellent" means that most to all original features (including later alterations or additions that are considered historic) are intact

and would require minor to moderate maintenance or repair to preserve architectural integrity. "Poor" and "fair" means that many original features have been removed, and/or that remaining elements are in a state of deterioration, and/or that unsympathetic alterations are hiding or detracting from the remaining historic features.

Survey Data

Two hundred six Inventory forms were completed in the Penn Neighborhood Survey Project. In a few instances, where more than one building was similar and all were obviously constructed at the same time, two or more dwellings were recorded on a single inventory sheet. A total of two hundred ten buildings were documented in the survey, nine of them were non-residential buildings. Residential buildings that exhibited architectural integrity and were considered to be contributing historic resources numbered one hundred ninety four; seven non-contributing residential buildings were recorded on inventory forms. (Note: The non-contributing number does not include all of this category in the survey area; those that were recorded had minimal integrity, therefore, in their present state, were considered not to have historical/architectural significance.)

All non-residential buildings documented possessed significance. They included three circa 1870 churches, a school (1909), a fire station (circa 1939), and three commercial structures (a circa 1880/1923, one-story neighborhood store, a small 1923 Classic Revival office building, and an 1899, two-story warehouse building). The Patee House Museum, which is already listed on the National Register of Historic Places, was also inventoried.

Analysis of Survey Data

Of the one hundred ninety-four contributing residential buildings in the project area, one hundred thirty-nine were single family dwellings, forty-six were duplexes and nine were multi-family residences. Thirty-six of the total (201) recorded residential structures were believed to be constructed before 1865, fifty-seven between 1865 and 1890, ninety-five between 1891 and 1915, and thirteen between 1916 and 1940.

Property type classification varied from the definite vernacular dwellings of the lower economic class to large mansions of the upper class; the latter being few in

number. The majority of duplexes probably originally housed middle class residences.

Stylistic features of designated residential buildings were attributed as follows:

- Greek Revival, constructed ca 1845-1860: four single family.
- Italianate/Gothic Revival, constructed ca 1860-1880: twenty-six single family, twelve duplexes, one multi-family.
- Second Empire, constructed ca 1870: five single family, one duplex.
- Queen Anne, constructed ca 1880-1905: twenty-four single family, ten duplexes.
- Colonial Revival, constructed ca 1890-1915: sixteen single family, four duplexes.
- Classic Revival, constructed ca 1900-1915: twelve single family, fifteen duplexes, four multi-family.
- Ramanesque, constructed ca 1890: one single family, one multi-family.
- Renaissance Revival, constructed ca 1890: one duplex.
- Neoclassical, constructed ca 1900-1915: ten single family, one duplex, three multi-family.
- Bungalow/Arts & Crafts, constructed ca 1905-1930: nine single family, two duplexes.
- Eclectic, constructed ca 1900: one single family.
- Vernacular, constructed ca 1850-1920: thirty-six single family, one duplex, one multi-family.

Residential property types that were documented in the project area give evidence of those that were established in the recent report, "Property Type Analysis" by Deon Wolfenbarger. The dwellings' association with certain historic contexts, as they were defined in this project's "Research Design" and in the more comprehensive "Historic Context Statement", by Deon Wolfenbarger, can be assumed with the concrete evidence provided on the Inventory forms. (This researcher must "assume"

association because actual records of some of the buildings were not available or in existence. For purposes of this report, assumption must suffice since all of the properties could not be documented.)

Recommendations

- A. National Register Nominations - There were at least three buildings in the Penn Neighborhood survey area that would be individually eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places. The ca 1860 Italianate dwelling at 619 South Thirteenth Street is an outstanding example of its architectural type. It also has possible significance as a representation of a dwelling that reflects the economic, cultural and social values of the city's early commerce period and/or as it is associated with an important figure in the history of the city (Bela M. Hughes). 628 South Thirteenth is another representation of Italianate residential property type with significant architectural integrity. 701 South Eleventh Street is a good example of Richardsonian Romanesque influence. It also has significance as a design (probably) executed by Harvey Ellis and is important in its association with the original owner who was a prominent businessman in the city's wholesale industry. Other possibly eligible buildings are at 609 South Thirteenth Street and 1322 Olive Street; both are outstanding examples of Neoclassical single family dwellings. 1101 South Eleventh Street is a significant ca 1850 vernacular, Greek Revival cottage.

Areas of the current survey could be included in the already established Museum Hill Historic District. Dwellings in the block of Ninth Street south of Messanie, on Tenth Street from Messanie to Patee, on the south side of Messanie between Tenth and Thirteenth Streets and on Thirteenth Street from Messanie to approximately on a line even with Mary Street have a strong style and character relationship to those in the Museum Hill district.

Another district on the east side of the survey area is possible; however, the eastern edge of the potential district requires definition with further survey work. The west boundary should be a line running south from Messanie west of the properties on Fourteenth Street to Olive Street, west to Thirteenth Street, south to Lafayette Street, west to Vine

Street, south to Seneca Street, east to Twelfth Street, south to Penn Street, east to east side of Patee Museum, south to Mitchell Avenue and east to Fourteenth Street. Vine Street is a completely intact, brick street and should be included as a contributing element.

Buildings outside of the proposed boundaries were excluded from the Museum Hill extended district and the Incomplete Penn Neighborhood district for two reasons. Most exhibited only marginal integrity due to excessive alterations and deterioration; and the extent of demolition that has occurred and the resulting number of vacant lots has rendered them insignificant in a district nomination.

A building that was not photographed that contributes to the proposed district was included in the survey data after boundaries were drawn. It is a Colonial Revival duplex constructed in 1909 at 1013-15 Vine Street (Inventory #117A).

Comprehensive Preservation Planning

Future community development activity in the proposed districts within the Penn Neighborhood survey area should focus on appropriate rehabilitation and revitalization. There are many viable buildings that would enhance the historic characteristics that are present if proper preservation tools and techniques were applied. The problems of abandonment and neglect should be addressed particularly in the proposed districts.

Dwellings outside of the two boundaries that also should be considered worthy of rehabilitation or preservation are properties documented on Inventory form numbers: 13, 14, 38, 39, 40, 41, 56, 57, 59, 60, 65, 69, 75, 76, 77, 80, 82, 103, 104, 105, 109, 110, and 202. Also, an undocumented ca 1870 dwelling at 919 South Eleventh Street has high integrity as a representation of Italianate residential property type.

Conclusion

An important activity for achieving either National Register/local landmark designation or a feasible, comprehensive historic preservation plan is public education. It is important that this study (and other historic resource surveys) be made known and readily available to the general public, special interest groups and political leaders, and that it be in a usable and

Penn Neighborhood Project Survey
Final Report
July 29, 1988
Page 10

understandable form so that information and data can be used by city planners and other city staff who administer programs involving historic buildings and areas.

Copies of this report are being furnished to public officials, city staff and the media. Original inventory forms, photographs, maps and reports are deposited with the State of Missouri Department of Natural Resources, Division of Parks, Recreation, and Historic Preservation. Reproductions of all project documents are located in the Department of Community Development, St. Joseph City Hall for the benefit of the citizens of the community. The historic preservation movement becomes a futile effort if historic building research documents are filed away only to be used by other historic preservation professionals.